Versioned Archive and Review of Biotic Interactions and Taxon Names Found within Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database hash://md5/426a5c3cc3007991759a6b413043cc8f

by Nomer, Elton and Preston, three naive review bots review@globalbioticinteractions.org https://globalbioticinteractions.org/contribute https://github.com/Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database/issues

2025-07-09

Abstract

Life on Earth is sustained by complex interactions between organisms and their environment. These biotic interactions can be captured in datasets and published digitally. We present a review and archiving process for such an openly accessible digital interactions dataset of known origin and discuss its outcome. The dataset under review, named Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database, has fingerprint hash://md5/426a5c3cc3007991759a6b413043cc8f, is 2.58MiB in size and contains 3,231 interaction with 19 unique types of associations (e.g., visitsFlowersOf) between 499 primary taxa (e.g., Andrena Imitatrix) and 860 associated taxa (e.g., Limnanthes). This report includes detailed summaries of interaction data, a taxonomic review from multiple catalogs, and an archived version of the dataset from which the reviews are derived.

Contents

Introduction Data Review and Archive	2 2
Methods	2
Results Files	4 4
Archived Dataset	13
Blotic Interactions	13

Interaction Networks	18
Taxonomic Alignment	21
Additional Reviews	24
GloBI Review Badge	25
GloBI Index Badge	25
Discussion	26
Acknowledgements	26
Author contributions	26
References	27

Introduction

Data Review and Archive

Data review and archiving can be a time-consuming process, especially when done manually. This review report aims to help facilitate both activities. It automates the archiving of datasets, including Darwin Core archives, and is a citable backup of a version of the dataset. Additionally, an automatic review of species interaction claims made in the dataset is generated and registered with Global Biotic Interactions (J. H. Poelen, Simons, and Mungall 2014).

This review includes summary statistics about, and observations about, the dataset under review:

Seltmann, K., Van Wagner, J., Behm, R., Brown, Z., Tan, E., & Liu, K. (2020). BID: A project to share biotic interaction and ecological trait data about bees (Hymenoptera: Anthophila). UC Santa Barbara: Cheadle Center for Biodiversity and Ecological Restoration. Retrieved from https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1g21k7bf https://github.com/Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database/archive/2b6280426c667024918e73622bf4b6c24a906bf1.zip 2025-07-04T22:42:24.629Z hash://md5/426a5c3cc3007991759a6b413043cc8f

For additional metadata related to this dataset, please visit https://github.c om/Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database and inspect associated metadata files including, but not limited to, *README.md*, *eml.xml*, and/or *globi.json*.

Methods

The review is performed through programmatic scripts that leverage tools like Preston (Elliott et al. 2025), Elton (Kuhn, Poelen, and Leinweber 2025), Nomer (Salim and Poelen 2025), globinizer (J. Poelen, Seltmann, and Mietchen 2024) combined with third-party tools like grep, mlr, tail and head.

tool name	version
preston	0.10.1
elton	0.15.13
nomer	0.5.17
globinizer	0.4.0
mlr	6.0.0
jq	1.6
yq	4.25.3
pandoc	3.1.6.1
duckdb	1.3.1

Table 1: Tools used in this review process

The review process can be described in the form of the script below 1 .

get versioned copy of the dataset (size approx. 2.58MiB) under review elton pull Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database

```
# generate review notes
elton review Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database\
    > review.tsv
# export indexed interaction records
elton interactions Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database\
    > interactions.tsv
```

export names and align them with the Catalogue of Life using Nomer elton names Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database\

- | nomer append col\
- > name-alignment.tsv

or visually, in a process diagram.

You can find a copy of the full review script at check-data.sh. See also GitHub and Codeberg.

¹Note that you have to first get the data (e.g., via elton pull Extended-Bee-Network/beeinteraction-database) before being able to generate reviews (e.g., elton review Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database), extract interaction claims (e.g., elton interactions Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database), or list taxonomic names (e.g., elton names Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-database)



Figure 1: Review Process Overview

Results

In the following sections, the results of the review are summarized 2 . Then, links to the detailed review reports are provided.

Files

The following files are produced in this review:

filename	description
biblio.bib	list of bibliographic reference of this review
check-dataset.sh	data review workflow/process as expressed in a bash script
data.zip	a versioned archive of the data under review
HEAD	the digital signature of the data under review
index.docx	review in MS Word format
index.html	review in HTML format
index.md	review in Pandoc markdown format
index.pdf	review in PDF format
indexed-citations.csv.gz	list of distinct reference citations for reviewed species interaction claims in gzipped comma-separated values file format
$indexed\-citations.html.gz$	list of distinct reference citations for reviewed species interactions claims in gzipped html file format
indexed-citations.tsv.gz	list of distinct reference citations for reviewed species interaction claims in gzipped tab-separated values format

 $^{^{2}}$ Disclaimer: The results in this review should be considered friendly, yet naive, notes from an unsophisticated robot. Please keep that in mind when considering the review results.

filename	description
indexed-interactions-col-family-col- family.svg	network diagram showing the taxon family to taxon family interaction claims in the dataset under review as interpreted by the Catalogue of Life via Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024)
indexed-interactions-col-kingdom-col-kingdom.svg	network diagram showing the taxon kingdom to taxon kingom interaction claims in the dataset under review as interpreted by the Catalogue of Life via Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024)
indexed-interactions.csv.gz	species interaction claims indexed from the dataset under review in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-interactions.html.gz	species interaction claims indexed from the dataset under review in gzipped html format
indexed-interactions.tsv.gz	species interaction claims indexed from the dataset under review in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-interactions.parquet	species interaction claims indexed from the dataset under review in Apache Parquet format
indexed-interactions-sample.csv	list of species interaction claims indexed from the dataset under review in gzipped comma-separated values format
$indexed\-interactions\-sample.html$	first 500 species interaction claims indexed from the dataset under review in html format
indexed-interactions-sample.tsv	first 500 species interaction claims indexed from the dataset under review in tab-separated values format
indexed-names.csv.gz	taxonomic names indexed from the dataset under review in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review in gzipped html format
indexed-names.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review in gzipped tab-separated values format

filename	description
indexed-names.parquet	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review in Apache Barguet format
indexed-names-resolved-col.csv.gz	Parquet format taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Catalogue of Life as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-col.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Catalogue of Life as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format
indexed-names-resolved-col.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Catalogue of Life as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-col.parquet	 taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Catalogue of Life as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format
indexed-names-resolved- discoverlife.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Discover Life bee species checklist as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved- discoverlife.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Discover Life bee species checklist as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format

filename	description
indexed-names-resolved- discoverlife.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Discover Life bee species checklist as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.) Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved- discoverlife.parquet	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Discover Life bee species checklist as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format
indexed-names-resolved-gbif.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with GBIF Backbone Taxonomy as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-gbif.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with GBIF Backbone Taxonomy as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format
indexed-names-resolved-gbif.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with GBIF Backbone Taxonomy as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-gbif.parquet	tab-separated values format taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with GBIF Backbone Taxonomy as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format

filename	description
indexed-names-resolved-itis.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Integrated Taxonomic Information System (ITIS) as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-itis.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Integrated Taxonomic Information System (ITIS) as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format
indexed-names-resolved-itis.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Integrated Taxonomic Information System (ITIS) as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-itis.parquet	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Integrated Taxonomic Information System (ITIS) as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format
indexed-names-resolved-mdd.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Mammal Diversity Database as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-mdd.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Mammal Diversity Database as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format

filename	description
indexed-names-resolved-mdd.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Mammal Diversity Database as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-mdd.parquet	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Mammal Diversity Database as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format
indexed-names-resolved-ncbi.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the NCBI Taxonomy as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-ncbi.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the NCBI Taxonomy as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format
indexed-names-resolved-ncbi.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the NCBI Taxonomy as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-ncbi.parquet	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the NCBI Taxonomy as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format

filename	description
indexed-names-resolved-pbdb.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Paleobiology Database as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-pbdb.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Paleobiology Database as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format
indexed-names-resolved-pbdb.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Paleobiology Database as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-pbdb.parquet	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with Paleobiology Database as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format
indexed-names-resolved-tpt.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Terrestrial Parasite Tracker (TPT) Taxonomic Resource as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-tpt.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Terrestrial Parasite Tracker (TPT) Taxonomic Resource as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format

filename	description
indexed-names-resolved-tpt.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Terrestrial Parasite Tracker (TPT) Taxonomic Resource as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-tpt.parquet	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the Terrestrial Parasite Tracker (TPT) Taxonomic Resource as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format
indexed-names-resolved-wfo.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the World of Flora Online as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-wfo.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the World of Flora Online as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format
indexed-names-resolved-wfo.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the World of Flora Online as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped tab-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved-wfo.parquet	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the World of Flora Online as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in Apache Parquet format

filename	description
indexed-names-resolved-worms.csv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the World Register of Marine Species (WoRMS) as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped comma-separated values format
indexed-names-resolved- worms.html.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the World Register of Marine Species (WoRMS) as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped html format
indexed-names-resolved-worms.tsv.gz	taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the World Register of Marine Species (WoRMS) as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H (ed.). Poelen 2024) in gzipped
indexed-names-resolved- worms.parquet	tab-separated values format taxonomic names found in the dataset under review aligned with the World Register of Marine Species (WoRMS) as accessed through the Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources (J. H. (ed.). Poelen 2024)
indexed-names-sample.csv	in Apache Parquet format first 500 taxonomic names found in the dataset under review in comma-separated values format
indexed-names-sample.html	first 500 taxonomic names found in the dataset under review in html format
indexed-names-sample.tsv	first 500 taxonomic names found in the dataset under review in tab-separated values format
interaction.svg	diagram summarizing the data model used to index species interaction claims
nanopub-sample.trig	first 500 species interaction claims as expressed in the nanopub format (Kuhn and Dumontier 2014)

filename	description
nanopub.trig.gz	species interaction claims as
	expressed in the nanopub format
	(Kuhn and Dumontier 2014)
process.svg	diagram summarizing the data review
	processing workflow
prov.nq	origin of the dataset under review as
	expressed in rdf/nquads
review.csv.gz	review notes associated with the
	dataset under review in gripped
	comma-separated values format
review.html.gz	review notes associated with the
	dataset under review in gzipped html
	format
review.tsv.gz	review notes associated with the
	dataset under review in gripped
	tab-separated values format
review-sample.csv	first 500 review notes associated with
	the dataset under review in
	comma-separated values format
review-sample.html	first 500 review notes associated with
	the dataset under review in html
	format
review-sample.tsv	first 500 review notes associated with
	the dataset under review in
	tab-separated values format
review.svg	a review badge generated as part of
	the dataset review process
zenodo.json	metadata of this review expressed in
	Zenodo record metadata

Archived Dataset

Note that *data.zip* file in this archive contains the complete, unmodified archived dataset under review.

Biotic Interactions

In this review, biotic interactions (or biotic associations) are modeled as a primary (aka subject, source) organism interacting with an associate (aka object, target) organism. The dataset under review classified the primary/associate organisms with specific taxa. The primary and associate organisms The kind of interaction is documented as an interaction type.

The dataset under review, named Extended-Bee-Network/bee-interaction-



Figure 2: Biotic Interaction Data Model

database, has fingerprint hash://md5/426a5c3cc3007991759a6b413043cc8f, is 2.58MiB in size and contains 3,231 interaction with 19 unique types of associations (e.g., visitsFlowersOf) between 499 primary taxa (e.g., Andrena Imitatrix) and 860 associated taxa (e.g., Limnanthes).

An exhaustive list of indexed interaction claims can be found in gzipped csv, tsv and parquet archives. To facilitate discovery, a preview of claims available in the gzipped html page at indexed-interactions.html.gz are shown below.

The exhaustive list was used to create the following data summaries below.

sourceTaxonName	interaction Type Namtarget Taxon Name		referenceCitation
Melissodes pullatella	visitsFlowersOf	Grindelia integrifolia x Grindelia nana	Severns, P. M. & Moldenke, A. R. (2010) Management tradeoffs between focal species and biodiversity: Endemic plant) conservation and solitary bee extinction. Biodivers. Conserv. 19, 3605-3609.

Table 3: Sample of Indexed Interaction Claims

sourceTaxonName	interactionTypeN	amtargetTaxonName	referenceCitation
Melissodes pullatella	visitsFlowersOf	Grindelia integrifolia x Grindelia nana	Severns, P. M. & Moldenke, A. R. (2010) Management tradeoffs between focal species and biodiversity: Endemic plant) conservation and solitary bee extinction. Biodivers. Conserv. 19, 3605-3609.
Melissodes pullatella	visitsFlowersOf	Grindelia integrifolia x Grindelia nana	Severns, P. M. & Moldenke, A. R. (2010) Management tradeoffs between focal species and biodiversity: Endemic plant) conservation and solitary bee extinction. Biodivers. Conserv. 19, 3605-3609.
Melissodes pullatella	visitsFlowersOf	Grindelia integrifolia x Grindelia nana	Severns, P. M. & Moldenke, A. R. (2010) Management tradeoffs between focal species and biodiversity: Endemic plant) conservation and solitary bee extinction. Biodivers. Conserv. 19, 3605-3609.

interactionTypeName	count
visitsFlowersOf	2396
visits	432
pollinates	86
kleptoparasiteOf	82
coOccursWith	73
eats	43
interactsWith	36
hasParasitoid	22
hasHost	19
parasiteOf	14
hasPathogen	9
hasParasite	6
ectoparasiteOf	3
adjacentTo	3
commensalistOf	2
vectorOf	2
preyedUponBy	1
laysEggsOn	1
preysOn	1

Table 4: Most Frequently Mentioned Interaction Types (up to 20 most frequent)

Table 5: Most Frequently Mentioned Primary Taxa (up to 20 most frequent)

sourceTaxonName	count
Andrena Imitatrix	208
Andrena cressonii	151
Habropoda depressa	144
Andrena thaspii	124
Apis mellifera	123
Andrena (Hesperandrena) limnanthis	68
Bombus	59
Perdita nuda	58
Panurginus atriceps	54
Andrena milwaukeensis	44
Panurginus occidentalis	43
Andrena mandibularis	41
Andrena alleghaniensis	38
Andrena rubi	36
Andrena topazana	36
-	

sourceTaxonName	count
Andrena fenningeri	34
Andrena atlantica	34
Andrena birtwelli	34
Andrena (Hesperandrena)	33

Table 6: Most Frequently Mentioned Associate Taxa (up to 20 most frequent)

targetTaxonName	count
Limnanthes	138
Cucurbita pepo L.	88
Lasthenia	80
Persea americana	79
Salix	68
Homo sapiens	56
Augochlorella	39
Prunus	33
Ribes	32
Platystemon californicus	30
Salix lasiolepis	30
Ceanothus	29
Arctostaphylos	26
Phacelia	26
Sphecodes	26
Blennosperma	24
Crataegus	24
Rubus	23
Downingia	22

Table 7: Most Frequent Interactions between Primary and Associate Taxa (up to 20 most frequent)

interactionTypeNa	mtargetTaxonName	count
visitsFlowersOf	Limnanthes	67
visitsFlowersOf	Limnanthes	36
visitsFlowersOf	Lasthenia	33
	visitsFlowersOf visitsFlowersOf	visitsFlowersOf Limnanthes

sourceTaxonName	interactionTypeNa	mtargetTaxonName	count
Sphecodes	kleptoparasiteOf	Augochlorella	32
pimpinellae			
Andrena	visitsFlowersOf	Salix lasiolepis	28
subrubicunda			
Perdita nuda	coOccursWith	Sphecodes	26
Andrena	visitsFlowersOf	Lasthenia	22
(Diandrena)			
submoesta			
Peponapis	visitsFlowersOf	Cucurbita pepo	16
Pruinosa		L.	
Perdita nuda	coOccursWith	Mucor	14
Micralictoides	visits	Escholtzia	11
ruficaudus		californica	
Micralictoides	visits	Chaenactis	10
chaenactidis		glabriuscula	
Andrena	visitsFlowersOf	Blennosperma	10
(Diandrena)			
blennospermatis			
Andrena stipator	visitsFlowersOf	Cryptantha	10
Andrena biareola	visitsFlowersOf	Platystemon	10
		californicus	
Andrena buccata	visitsFlowersOf	Platystemon	10
Panurginus	visitsFlowersOf	Downingia	9
atriceps			
Panurginus	visitsFlowersOf	Downingia	9
atriceps		bicornuta	
Panurginus	visitsFlowersOf	Downingia	9
atriceps		concolor	
Panurginus	visitsFlowersOf	Downingia	9
atriceps		$\operatorname{cuspidata}$	

Interaction Networks

The figures below provide a graph view on the dataset under review. The first shows a summary network on the kingdom level, and the second shows how interactions on the family level. It is important to note that both network graphs were first aligned taxonomically using the Catalogue of Life. Please refer to the original (or verbatim) taxonomic names for a more original view on the interaction data.

You can download the indexed dataset under review at indexed-interactions.c sv.gz. A tab-separated file can be found at indexed-interactions.tsv.gz

Learn more about the structure of this download at GloBI website, by opening a GitHub issue, or by sending an email.



Figure 3: Interactions on taxonomic kingdom rank as interpreted by the Catalogue of Life download svg $\,$



Figure 4: Interactions on the taxonomic family rank as interpreted by the Catalogue of Life. download svg

Another way to discover the dataset under review is by searching for it on the GloBI website.

Taxonomic Alignment

As part of the review, all names are aligned against various name catalogs (e.g., col, ncbi, discoverlife, gbif, itis, wfo, mdd, tpt, pbdb, and worms). These alignments can help review name usage or aid in selecting of a suitable taxonomic name resource.

providedName	relationName	resolvedCatalogNamesolvedNan	ne
Acacia Acacia verticillata	HAS_ACCEPTED HAS_ACCEPTED		
Acacia verticillata	SYNONYM_OF	col Acacia verticillata	
Aesculus hippocastanum	HAS_ACCEPTED	D_CNIAME Aesculus hippocastan	um

Table 8: Sample of Name Alignments

Table 9: Distribution of Taxonomic Ranks of Aligned Names by Catalog. Names that were not aligned with a catalog are counted as NAs. So, the total number of unaligned names for a catalog will be listed in their NA row.

resolvedCatalogName	$\operatorname{resolvedRank}$	count
col	NA	198
col	family	12
col	genus	272
col	section	1
col	species	779
col	subfamily	1
col	subgenus	2
col	subspecies	44
col	variety	10
discoverlife	NA	981
discoverlife	species	316
gbif	NA	145
gbif	family	15
gbif	genus	289
gbif	species	794
gbif	subspecies	65
gbif	variety	23

resolvedCatalogName	$\operatorname{resolvedRank}$	count
itis	NA	253
itis	family	15
itis	genus	256
itis	species	731
itis	subspecies	26
itis	variety	16
mdd	NA	1297
ncbi	NA	402
ncbi	family	13
ncbi	genus	261
ncbi	section	1
ncbi	species	603
ncbi	subgenus	17
ncbi	subspecies	7
ncbi	varietas	3
pbdb	NA	1131
pbdb	family	14
pbdb	genus	121
pbdb	kingdom	1
pbdb	species	30
pbdb	tribe	1
tpt	NA	1293
tpt	genus	2
tpt	species	2
wfo	NA	612
wfo	family	11
wfo	genus	209
wfo	section	2
wfo	species	445
wfo	subsection	1
wfo	subspecies	20
wfo	variety	10
worms	NA	1061
worms	family	8
worms	genus	134
worms	species	93
worms	subspecies	2

Table 10: Name relationship types per catalog. Name relationship type "NONE" means that a name was not recognized by the associated catalog. "SAME_AS" indicates either a "HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME" or "SYNONYM_OF" name relationship type. We recognize that "SYNONYM_OF" encompasses many types of nomenclatural synonymies (ICZN 1999) (e.g., junior synonym, senior synonyms).

${\it resolved} Catalog Name$	relationName	count
col	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	1051
col	SYNONYM_OF	478
col	NONE	204
discoverlife	NONE	1121
discoverlife	SYNONYM_OF	152
discoverlife	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	258
discoverlife	HOMONYM_OF	12
gbif	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	1379
gbif	SYNONYM_OF	686
gbif	NONE	145
itis	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	1028
itis	SYNONYM_OF	211
itis	NONE	255
mdd	NONE	1463
mdd	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	2
ncbi	SAME_AS	994
ncbi	SYNONYM_OF	102
ncbi	NONE	418
pbdb	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	218
pbdb	NONE	1237
pbdb	SYNONYM_OF	13
tpt	NONE	1461
tpt	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	4
wfo	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	641
wfo	SYNONYM_OF	213
wfo	NONE	684
wfo	HAS_UNCHECKED_NAME	132
worms	NONE	1177
worms	HAS_ACCEPTED_NAME	291
worms	SYNONYM_OF	50

catalog name	alignment results
col	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
ncbi	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
discoverlife	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
gbif	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
itis	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
wfo	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
mdd	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
tpt	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
pbdb	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)
worms	associated names alignments report in gzipped html, csv, and tsv)

Table 11: List of Available Name Alignment Reports

Additional Reviews

Elton, Nomer, and other tools may have difficulties interpreting existing species interaction datasets. Or, they may misbehave, or otherwise show unexpected behavior. As part of the review process, detailed review notes are kept that document possibly misbehaving, or confused, review bots. An sample of review notes associated with this review can be found below.

Table 12:	First	few	lines	in	the	review	notes.
10010 12.	1 11 00	10 11	moo	111	0110	101101	1100000.

reviewDate	reviewCommentType	reviewComment
2025-07-09T17:35:58Z	note	target taxon name missing
2025-07-09T17:35:58Z	note	target taxon name
2025-07-09T17:35:58Z	summary	missing https://github.com/Extended- Bee-Network/bee-
		interaction- database/archive/2b6280426c667024918e73622bf4b6c2
2025-07-09T17:35:58Z	summary	3231 interaction(s)

In addition, you can find the most frequently occurring notes in the table below.

Table 13: Most frequently occurring review notes, if any.

reviewComment	count
target taxon name missing	2

For additional information on review notes, please have a look at the first 500 Review Notes in html format or the download full gzipped csv or tsv archives.

GloBI Review Badge

As part of the review, a review badge is generated. This review badge can be included in webpages to indicate the review status of the dataset under review.

review	

Figure 5: Picture of a GloBI Review Badge ³

Note that if the badge is green, no review notes were generated. If the badge is yellow, the review bots may need some help with interpreting the species interaction data.

GloBI Index Badge

If the dataset under review has been registered with GloBI, and has been succesfully indexed by GloBI, the GloBI Index Status Badge will turn green. This means that the dataset under review was indexed by GloBI and is available through GloBI services and derived data products.

GloBI 🗸

Figure 6: Picture of a GloBI Index Badge ⁴

If you'd like to keep track of reviews or index status of the dataset under review, please visit GloBI's dataset index 5 for badge examples.

 $^{^{3}\}mathrm{Up}\text{-to-date}$ status of the GloBI Review Badge can be retrieved from the GloBI Review Depot

⁴Up-to-date status of the GloBI Index Badge can be retrieved from GloBI's API

 $^{^5\}mathrm{At}$ time of writing (2025-07-09) the version of the GloBI dataset index was available at https://globalbioticinteractions.org/datasets

Discussion

This review and archive provides a means of creating citable versions of datasets that change frequently. This may be useful for dataset managers, including natural history collection data managers, as a backup archive of a shared Darwin Core archive. It also serves as a means of creating a trackable citation for the dataset in an automated way, while also including some information about the contents of the dataset.

This review aims to provide a perspective on the dataset to aid in understanding of species interaction claims discovered. However, it is important to note that this review does *not* assess the quality of the dataset. Instead, it serves as an indication of the open-ness⁶ and FAIRness (Wilkinson et al. 2016; Trekels et al. 2023) of the dataset: to perform this review, the data was likely openly available, **F**indable, **A**ccessible, **I**nteroperable and **R**eusable. The current Open-FAIR assessment is qualitative, and a more quantitative approach can be implemented with specified measurement units.

This report also showcases the reuse of machine-actionable (meta)data, something highly recommended by the FAIR Data Principles (Wilkinson et al. 2016). Making (meta)data machine-actionable enables more precise processing by computers, enabling even naive review bots like Nomer and Elton to interpret the data effectively. This capability is crucial for not just automating the generation of reports, but also for facilitating seamless data exchanges, promoting interoperability.

Acknowledgements

We thank the many humans that created us and those who created and maintained the data, software and other intellectual resources that were used for producing this review. In addition, we are grateful for the natural resources providing the basis for these human and bot activities. Also, thanks to https://github.com/zygoballus for helping improve the layout of the review tables.

Author contributions

Nomer was responsible for name alignments. Elton carried out dataset extraction, and generated the review notes. Preston tracked, versioned, and packaged, the dataset under review.

 $^{^{6}\}rm According$ to http://opendefinition.org/: "Open data is data that can be freely used, reused and redistributed by anyone - subject only, at most, to the requirement to attribute and sharealike."

References

- Elliott, Michael, Jorrit Poelen, Icaro Alzuru, Emilio Berti, and partha04patel. 2025. "Bio-Guoda/Preston: 0.10.5." Zenodo. https://doi.org/10.5281/zeno do.14662206.
- ICZN. 1999. "International Code of Zoological Nomenclature." The International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London, UK. https://www.iczn.o rg/the-code/the-code-online/.
- Kuhn, Tobias, and Michel Dumontier. 2014. "Trusty URIs: Verifiable, Immutable, and Permanent Digital Artifacts for Linked Data." In *The Semantic Web: Trends and Challenges*, edited by Valentina Presutti, Claudia d'Amato, Fabien Gandon, Mathieu d'Aquin, Steffen Staab, and Anna Tordai, 395–410. Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Kuhn, Tobias, Jorrit Poelen, and Katrin Leinweber. 2025. "Globalbioticinteractions/Elton: 0.15.1." Zenodo. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.14927734.
- Poelen, Jorrit H. (ed.). 2024. "Nomer Corpus of Taxonomic Resources Hash://Sha256/ B60c0d25a16ae77b24305782017b1a270b79b5d1746f832650 F2027ba536e276 Hash://Md5/17f1363a277ee0e4ecaf1b91c665e47e." Zenodo. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.12695629.
- Poelen, Jorrit H., James D. Simons, and Chris J. Mungall. 2014. "Global Biotic Interactions: An Open Infrastructure to Share and Analyze Species-Interaction Datasets." *Ecological Informatics* 24 (November): 148–59. https: //doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoinf.2014.08.005.
- Poelen, Jorrit, Katja Seltmann, and Daniel Mietchen. 2024. "Globalbioticinteractions/Globinizer: 0.4.0." Zenodo. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.10647 565.
- Salim, José Augusto, and Jorrit Poelen. 2025. "Globalbioticinteractions/Nomer: 0.5.15." Zenodo. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.14893840.
- Trekels, Maarten, Debora Pignatari Drucker, José Augusto Salim, Jeff Ollerton, Jorrit Poelen, Filipi Miranda Soares, Max Rünzel, Muo Kasina, Quentin Groom, and Mariano Devoto. 2023. "WorldFAIR Project (D10.1) Agriculture-related pollinator data standards use cases report." Zenodo. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.8176978.
- Wilkinson, Mark D., Michel Dumontier, IJsbrand Jan Aalbersberg, Gabrielle Appleton, Myles Axton, Arie Baak, Niklas Blomberg, et al. 2016. "The FAIR Guiding Principles for Scientific Data Management and Stewardship." *Scientific Data* 3 (1). https://doi.org/10.1038/sdata.2016.18.